# II ILLUMINATIONS

ANNE MARGREET W. AS-VIJVERS *

Mech contains seven masses, four of which are decorated with miniatures and three with coloured initials. The decorations always accompany the Kyrie that opens each mass. Unlike other manuscripts, which contain ongoing texts, polyphonic choirbooks present four or five parallel lines of text and music that are to be sung simultaneously rather than successively. A choirbook is read two pages at a time (i.e., opening by opening), and the layout of the pages is adapted accordingly. The soprano part begins at the top left with the first letter of the text: an enlarged initial "K" for "Kyrie", the section that opens every mass. For the other parts, the first letter of the voice-types is used and the initials are smaller. The initial "T" for "Tenor" is at the bottom of the left-hand page; the contratenor is at the top of the right-hand page and the bassus is at the bottom right. If there are miniatures, they occupy the place of the Kyrie initial and sometimes the "C" for "Contratenor" opposite, as is the case in Mech. The other sections of the mass (Gloria, Credo, Sanctus, and Agnus Dei) are given cadel initials in black ink in this choirbook.[1]

The miniatures in Mech are of a high quality, and the initials with coloured grotesques are particularly refined. Although scholars have gone to great lengths to identify the people depicted in the opening miniature, the illumination of the choirbook has not yet received the attention it deserves. In this contribution, I will attempt to situate Mech's illuminator within the corpus of Alamire manuscripts that has been preserved. To do so, I will begin by discussing the iconography of the miniatures: the portraits of members of the house of Burgundy-Habsburg in the first two masses, the *Resurrection of Christ* in the second mass, the miniatures on the theme of the Immaculate Conception in the third

* I would like to thank David Burn and Honey Meconi for their valuable suggestions, Klaartje Proesmans (Alamire Foundation) for practical support while writing this article, and Willy Van de Vijver (Mechelen city archivist) and Ann Kelders (manuscript curator at the Royal Library of Belgium) for the opportunity to consult the necessary manuscripts.

1 See Schmidt, "Making Polyphonic Books in the Late Fifteenth and Early Sixteenth Centuries", 32–45.

mass, and the *Annunciation* in the fourth mass. I will then discuss the illuminator's style in the context of other manuscripts he produced, which include both choirbooks and other types of manuscripts. Finally, I will take a brief look at the grotesque initials in the last three masses in Mech.

## THE PORTRAITS OF CHARLES V AND MAXIMILIAN I

A young monarch on a throne is the radiant focal point of the miniature at the beginning of the *Missa Fors seulement* by Matthaeus Pipelare in Mech (fol. 1$^{v}$; ▶ Fig. I.1). For a long time, scholars believed this was a picture of Emperor Maximilian I of Austria, but the general view today is that it is his grandson, the future Charles V.[2] The manuscript was probably a gift from Maximilian to Charles to commemorate the declaration of his majority on 5 January 1515.[3] The title of the mass, as noted at the beginning of the tenor part, confirms this interpretation: the words "Fors seulement l'attente que je demeure" are a variation on the original song text expressing the desire for the young ruler to reign for a long time to come.[4]

▶ p. 162

Charles is presented as the legitimate heir to the throne of the Habsburg Empire. He is wearing armour, an ermine mantle and the collar of the Order of the Golden Fleece, and he is holding a sword and sceptre; his future crown is floating above the imperial eagle, which is holding the lily of spiritual power and the sword of worldly power aloft in human hands.[5] Charles's future rank is acknowledged and reinforced by the figures standing in the foreground: the Pope, a cardinal and a bishop on the left and a nobleman, knight and farmer on the right.[6] The scrolls above them contain appropriate quotations from the Psalms.[7]

The central section of the scene shows all Maximilian's grandchildren. Sitting next to Charles are his younger brother Ferdinand (born 1503) and his elder sister Eleanor (born 1498). The three girls in front of them appear to be younger, which means they must be his sisters Isabella (born 1501), Mary (born 1505), and – seen from behind – Catherine

2 This new interpretation is presented in: Warmington, "Mechelen, Archief en Stadsbibliothek MS s.s.".
3 Margaret of Austria is also named as the patron, but the manuscript does not contain any references to her.
4 Bousmar, "Maximilien D'Autriche ou le jeune Charles Quint?", 48; Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 170; Van der Heide, "Polytekstuele religieuze muziek", 134. See also the chapter by Borghetti in this book.
5 Cf. images of the Last Judgement, where the lily and sword emerge from the mouth of Christ. Kirschbaum and Braunfels, *Lexikon*, vol. 3, col. 101.
6 Eichberger, "Women who read are dangerous", 90–91; and Hofmann, "Portraits as Leitmotif", 222.
7 Ps. 89:1 and 89:16; Bousmar, "Maximilien D'Autriche ou le jeune Charles Quint?", 47.

(born 1507). There is a dog lying between the human figures. This part of the composition is reminiscent of depictions of the *Virgo inter virgines* (Mary surrounded by female virgin saints)[8] and the *Holy Kinship* (St. Anne surrounded by her husbands, children, and grandchildren).[9] The association emphasises the familial bonds between Maximilian's grandchildren and presents them as an ideal example. A scroll along the upper edge of the throne canopy, bearing a psalm text, pleads for the protection of Charles and his kin under the wings of the Empire.[10]

Close to Charles's head is the coat of arms of the Burgundian-Habsburg archdukes, which – after Charles's father, Philip the Fair, became king of Castile in 1504 – ceased to be a personal coat of arms, instead being incorporated into the arms of Philip himself, his six children (depicted in the miniature), and his sister Margaret of Austria.[11] The small miniatures at the beginning of the tenor primus and secundus, the contratenor, and the bassus show the coats of arms of Austria, the Duchy of Burgundy, Portugal, and the Archduchy of Burgundy-Habsburg quartered with Hungary.[12] The crossed branches included in the border decoration are a reference to the Burgundian cross or saltire, a saw-toothed form of the X-shaped cross of St. Andrew, although the other symbols of the house such as the fire-steel are not present here. References to the Spanish territories are absent; at the time Mech was made, the emphasis was still on the Burgundian Netherlands, which Charles had inherited from his grandmother Mary of Burgundy and his father Philip the Fair.[13]

The probable donor of Mech, Charles's grandfather Maximilian, also had himself painted (fol. 17$^{r}$; ▶ Fig. I.2). His portrait accompanies the second mass in the manuscript, Pierre de la Rue's *Missa pascale*, and he is depicted kneeling at a lectern with a prayer book on it. The imperial crown is beside him on the floor, and hanging from the frame around the miniature is a coat of arms displaying the imperial eagle. The bor-

▶ p. 163

8 For example, the *Virgo inter virgines* (Rouen, Musée des Beaux-Arts, inv. no. D.803.4) by Gerard David (1509) and similar images of seated female martyrs such as St. Catherine and St. Barbara in, e.g., the Grimani Breviary (Venice, Biblioteca Nazionale Marciana, Ms. Lat. I.99 (2138), e.g. fol. 828$^{v}$), where the women are wearing almost identical, richly decorated clothing.

9 For example, the Poortakker triptych (Ghent, Museum of Fine Arts, inv. no. S-106), which has been attributed to Gerard Horenbout (Kren and McKendrick, *Illuminating the Renaissance*, 375–76, 428).

10 Ps. 16:8; Bousmar, "Maximilien D'Autriche ou le jeune Charles Quint?", 45.

11 Hofmann, "Portraits as Leitmotif", 223.

12 Probably because of plans for a marriage with Hungary for Eleanor (since 1509) and Ferdinand (in 1515); Bousmar, "Maximilien D'Autriche ou le jeune Charles Quint?", 46.

13 Bousmar, "Maximilien D'Autriche ou le jeune Charles Quint?", 46.

der of his gold brocade surcoat is embroidered with blue letters, among which the word "ROEMS" can be deciphered (a reference to the Holy Roman Empire). The border decoration includes three scrolls with his motto "HALT MAS IN ALLEN DINGEN" ("Be moderate in all things"). Maximilian's gaze is directed towards the miniature of the Resurrection on the opposite page (fol. 16$^{v}$; ▶ Fig. II.1). The combination of a kneeling patron on the recto with a Madonna or another scene on the facing verso occurs frequently, in music manuscripts as well as books of hours and prayer books.[14] The person for whom a manuscript was intended was usually depicted in the company of their patron saint or guardian angel.[15] The miniature in Mech is the only one in the Alamire corpus where Maximilian is portrayed without a guardian angel.[16] This provides an extra indication that he did not have Mech made for himself, but for his grandson. Less than a year after the declaration of Charles's majority, his maternal grandfather Ferdinand II of Aragon died and Charles was proclaimed king of Spain. When he left the Netherlands for Spain in 1517, the iconography of the opening miniature was out of date. This may have been the reason he left the choirbook behind at the court in Mechelen.

▶ p. 165

## THE RESURRECTION

The first cantus firmus in the *Missa pascale* composed by Pierre de la Rue is the introit for Easter Sunday.[17] As is fitting for an Easter mass, the miniature accompanying the superius depicts the Resurrection of Christ (▶ Fig. II.1). His awakening from the dead is traditionally represented with Jesus rising from a grave or sarcophagus, but increasing realism in art led to portrayals of the tomb in the rock mentioned in Matthew's gospel.[18] The Resurrection is uncommon in books of hours, although the theme is found in luxurious examples that include extra texts and illustrations and in royal breviaries. In the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, various Flemish book illuminators developed compositions for this purpose including the tomb in the rock (sometimes in

▶ p. 165

14 Hofmann, "Portraits as Leitmotif".
15 Morrison, "Music Meant to Impress", 178–79.
16 Compare D-Ju 4, fol. 9$^{r}$, available online at http://idemdatabase.org/; A-Wn 15495, fol. 2$^{r}$, available online at http://digital.onb.ac.at/rep/access/open/10010A43.
17 See the chapter by Fuhrmann for the use of cantus firmus in this mass.
18 Mt. 27:59.

combination with a grave). Each distributes the various elements of the scene differently.[19] Mech contains a variant in which a large rock with a half-rounded stone door dominates the composition. The resurrected Jesus is standing before the tomb, which he has left without breaking the seal (the seals are represented as two white strips with a drop of red sealing-wax on them). Jesus is holding a cross staff with the banner of victory attached to it, and he is making a gesture of blessing. The wounds of the crucifixion are still visible in his side, hands, and feet. The posture, gesture, and clothing of this figure of Jesus bring together the Paschal Lamb, the resurrected Christ who will shortly ascend to heaven, and the judge who will appear in the clouds during the Last Judgement.[20] The Roman soldiers who were supposed to be guarding the tomb are still asleep, which is a sign of their lack of faith. In the foreground, a soldier has been startled out of his sleep; his eyes are dazzled by the light that radiates from the risen Christ and he has dropped his shield and staff. In the hilly landscape in the background, the three women, Mary Magdalene, Mary Salome, and Mary the mother of James, are approaching with the intention of anointing Jesus's dead body. The various elements of the scene (the risen Christ, the tomb in the rock, the fearful soldier, and the three Marys) also recur in the antiphon texts that La Rue incorporated into the sections of his mass.[21]

There are two other examples of the Resurrection in the Alamire corpus. The version in A-Wn 15497 is certainly based on the same model as the one in Mech, but the "set pieces" are distributed differently: three of the soldiers – one of whom is not depicted in Mech – are now awake, and the three Marys are close to the tomb.[22] In D-Ju 4 (see below), which was produced not long after Mech, the illuminator painted a variant in which he suggested a greater distance between viewer and subject, lending the figure of Christ a less hieratic appearance. The rocks where the tomb is located have been extended on the right-hand side of the picture, creating a natural "gateway" through which the three Marys are passing on

19 The earliest example known to me (c. 1490) is a miniature by the "Master of the First Prayer Book of Maximilian I" in the La Flora Book *of Hours* (Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale di Napoli, Ms I.B.51, fol. 54ᵛ). Dekeyzer discusses a few examples in *Herfsttij van de Vlaamse miniatuurkunst*, 129–30.

20 Cf. Schiller, *Ikonographie*, vol. 3, especially pages 73–74.

21 Besides Fuhrmann's chapter in the present book, see also Van der Heide, "Polytekstuele religieuze muziek", 144–45, 201–2.

22 Available online at http://digital.onb.ac.at/rep/access/open/100180AD.

their way to the grave. Behind these rocks, which dominate the middle distance of the composition, a vast landscape extends in hues of blue.[23]

## THE IMMACULATE CONCEPTION

The miniature that accompanies the third mass in Mech, La Rue's *Missa Conceptio tua*, depicts the Immaculate Conception of Mary in her mother Anne's womb (▶ Fig. II.2). This was a controversial theme.[24] Although the church father Augustine had excepted Mary, as the mother of God, from actual sin, medieval theologians could not agree as to whether she was free from original sin from the moment of her conception (the doctrine of the Immaculate Conception), or whether she had been sanctified in the womb (the sanctification doctrine). The Franciscans upheld the former standpoint; the Dominicans the latter. In 1477, Pope Sixtus IV attempted to settle the matter by issuing an apostolic constitution ratifying the doctrine of the Immaculate Conception, but this did not put an end to the debate.[25] Pope Sixtus IV, himself a member of the Franciscan order, is also said to have written a prayer about the Immaculate Conception (the *Ave sanctissima Maria*), to which he attached 11,000 years of indulgence if it was read before *Our Lady in the Sun* (an image of Mary with her child represented as the apocalyptic woman: clothed in the sun, with the moon beneath her feet). This prayer soon became widespread and popular, and it was also set to music. La Rue wrote a mass based on the *Ave sanctissima*, which is illustrated in the Alamire choirbooks with *Our Lady in the Sun*. He also wrote a second mass on the theme of the Immaculate Conception, based on the Magnificat antiphon *Conceptio tua*. Apparently there was no fixed iconography for this mass, because the three manuscripts in which an illustration has been preserved – including Mech – each have different imagery.[26]

▶ p. 165

In Mech, a relatively new theme was chosen: *Anna Gravida*, an image of Anne pregnant with Mary.[27] The strictly symmetrical composition

23 This version was adapted by Simon Bening for a miniature in the *Hortulus animae* (Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Cod. 2706, fol. 319$^{v}$).

24 See also Bull's discussion in this book.

25 Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 171; Blackburn, "The Virgin in the Sun", 175–89; As-Vijvers, "Weaving Mary's Chaplet", 59–60.

26 Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 168, 171, 173. B-Br 15075, fol. 1$^{v}$ (Mary in a *hortus conclusus* containing her symbolic names); D-Ju 4, fol. 29$^{v}$ (Mary and Eve next to the Tree of Life and the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil). The miniatures in four other manuscripts have been lost. See Appendix 4.

27 The usual way to represent Mary's conception was Joachim and Anne's meeting at the Golden Gate.

shows Anne sitting on a throne with her hands folded above the head of the unborn Mary, who is shown as a naked child in an aureole on her lap. The upper edge of the throne canopy bears the text "SANCTA ANNA ORATE PRO [NOBIS]".[28] As in the miniature portrait of the donor (fol. 1$^{v}$), a wall marks the middle ground of the composition. Behind this wall are the Old Testament kings David and Solomon (with their crowns and sceptres). They emphasise Mary's royal descent, and God the Father is blessing the scene from heaven.

The earliest examples of the *Anna Gravida* seem to have been produced in Hainaut and southern Flanders.[29] The theme rapidly gained popularity from 1500 onwards.[30] The Mechelen illuminator probably used a design by the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500. A book of hours illuminated by this master at roughly that time, owned by Margaret of Austria, contains an image of the *Anna Selbdritt*, depicting Anne enthroned in the same frontal pose (▶ Fig. II.3).[31] A small figure of Mary is standing on her lap (in this context, she is clothed and portrayed with her Child). Anne is flanked by two men, representing Joachim and Joseph here. (This alternative explains why David's traditional attribute, the harp, is missing in Mech). An almost exact parallel to the composition in Mech is found in a book of hours made for Jean II Carondelet in about 1500–15 (▶ Fig. II.4).[32] This cleric was among the highest-ranking officials in the Burgundian government, and became a member of the Secret Council in Mechelen in 1508.[33] All three manuscripts in which this composition occurs are therefore closely connected to the court in Mechelen.

▶ p. 166

▶ p. 167

28 "Saint Anne, pray for us" (with the Latin verb incorrectly in the plural).

29 Book of hours, Hainaut, c. 1460–80 (Philadelphia, Free Library, Lewis E 104, fol. 167$^{r}$): standing Anne with David and Solomon beside her; see http://ds.lib.berkeley.edu/LewisE104_4 and Heyder, "Kopie und Kennerschaft", n. 55. Book of hours, Mons, c. 1490–1500 (The Hague, Koninklijke Bibliotheek, Ms. 76 F 16, fol. 32$^{r}$): kneeling Anne; As-Vijvers and Korteweg, *Splendour of the Burgundian Netherlands*, 241 Fig. V.2.16.

30 For example, a panel by Jehan Bellegambe I of Douai (https://rkd.nl/explore/images/32683; location unknown); and St. Anne's altar for the Carmelites in Frankfurt, painted by a south-west Flemish master (Frankfurt-am-Main, Historisches Museum, inv. no. B 320; see Liebrich, "Frankfurt am Main, Kirche St. Maria 2015", with a link to images).

31 Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Cod. 1862, fol. 49$^{v}$; available online at http://data.onb.ac.at/rec/AC13948272. See Unterkircher (ed.), *De nationale bibliotheek van Oostenrijk*, 42–43, pls. 30–31; Thoss, *Flämische Buchmalerei*, 107–8 no. 69; Debae, *La bibliothèque de Marguerite d'Autriche*, 523–25; Kren and McKendrick, *Illuminating the Renaissance*, 394–95 incl. n. 2; for other literature, see http://www.cn-telma.fr//luxury-bound/manuscrit3549/ and http://www.manuscripta-mediaevalia.de/#|5.

32 New York, Morgan Library and Museum, Ms. M.390, fol. 122$^{v}$. See Wieck, *Painted Prayers*, 89 no. 6; for more images of this manuscript see https://www.themorgan.org/manuscript/112350.

33 On Carondelet, see Coenen, "Carondelet, Jean II" (available online via http://www.academieroyale.be/fr/la-biographie-nationale-personnalites/).

Other parallels of which I am aware display fundamental differences, and most are to be dated to a later period. Simon Bening returned to the composition in the Da Costa Hours in about 1515.[34] Instead of the frontal figure of Anne, he depicted her slightly turned, with her head inclined, absorbed in a prayer book. Bening had derived this type from a version of the *Anna Gravida* in which Anne is sitting on a turf bank in a landscape.[35] Another difference with Mech is that the unborn Mary in the Da Costa Hours is not standing on Anne's lap, but depicted in an aureole on her abdomen. The same turned figure of Anne is used in the version in the Grimani Breviary, where David and Solomon are standing full-length beside the throne.[36] Their names are included in golden letters, along with quotations from the Psalms and the Song of Songs relating to Mary's purity.[37]

Text is also used in Mech to reinforce the doctrine of the Immaculate Conception. The miniature of the *Anna Gravida* is supplemented by six portraits of popes, each of whom is holding a papal bull with their name and an appropriate quotation (▶ Fig. II.5).[38] All of them appear to be supporting the bull on the frame of the miniature. As if the parchments were documents, the lower edge of each painted bull curls upwards, and the papal seals (attached with red threads) dangle over the edge of the miniatures. The verso shows popes Leo I, Alexander V, and Sixtus IV in a horizontal line between the soprano and tenor parts. On the right-hand page are miniatures of Gregory the Great, Nicholas IV, and Innocent V at the beginning of the voice-parts. Since the scribe assumed that decorated initials would be painted here, the "T" of the tenor secundus and the "B" of the bassus are missing; only the "C" of the contratenor could be added into the small space between the miniature and the rubric.

▶ p. 168

## THE ANNUNCIATION

The fourth mass in Mech, La Rue's *Missa Ave Maria*, opens with a miniature of the Annunciation (▶ Fig. II.6): the angel Gabriel has entered Mary's home with a flapping cloak and beating wings. He raises his arm

▶ p. 170

34 New York, Morgan Library and Museum, Ms. M.399, fol. 351v (available online at https://www.themorgan.org/collection/da-costa-hours/thumbs). This book of hours is discussed further later in this article.
35 See the analysis by Heyder, "Kopie und Kennerschaft", paragraph 17–28.
36 Grimani Breviary (Venice, Biblioteca Nazionale Marciana, fol. 478ᵛ); König and Heyder, *Das Breviarium Grimani*, 156–57, Fig. 58.
37 König and Heyder, *Das Breviarium Grimani*, 157.
38 For an extensive analysis of the texts, see Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 178–79, 182.

high in the air to reinforce his message. Mary is half-turned towards the angel as the Holy Spirit descends upon her in the form of a dove. She is kneeling at a prie-dieu with a baldachin above it. The prayer book and the vase of lilies indicate her piety and purity. A room is visible in the background, furnished with a canopied bed and a cupboard with tableware on it. A kettle is hanging in a niche that can be concealed with a white curtain. The passage leading outside reveals a landscape with a church and a few trees. The decorated border consists of blossoming branches encircled with scrolls bearing the angel's message ("AVE MARIA GRACIA PLENA") and Mary's response ("ECCE ANCILLA DOMINI").[39]

The *Annunciation* is the customary illustration for the beginning of the Hours of the Virgin, the most important section in a book of hours. Since it is one of the most frequently occurring images, many variants exist. The angel sometimes comes from the left, sometimes from the right, and may or may not have a raised arm. Mary is sometimes seated in a homely room, sometimes in a sacred space, or, often, in a twofold space that suggests both a church and a private room. The composition in Mech brings together elements from all kinds of variants developed by different illuminators. The side wall, receding on the diagonal, with an adjacent gallery is reminiscent of variants with a church. The baldachin also suggests a private chapel. At the same time, however, the illuminator emphasises the homeliness of the scene by painting the copper kettle and the bedroom in the background. The composite nature of the composition is also seen in the figure of the angel, who is looking over Mary rather than addressing her. In the original context, the angel occupied a lower position with respect to Mary. There is only one other *Annunciation* within the Alamire corpus, but it is not related to that of Mech either compositionally or stylistically.[40] The *Annunciations* in four other choir books have been lost.[41] Although one loose miniature of a stylistically related Annunciation has been preserved, probably from a choirbook, this one also has a different composition than the one in Mech.[42] In the

39 "Hail Mary, full of grace" and "Behold the handmaid of the Lord".
40 I-Rvat Chigi 234, fol. 19$^{v}$, available online at https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Chig.C.VIII.234.
41 Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 164–65.
42 New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, Robert Lehman Collection, inv. no. 1975.1.2473 (see Hindman et al., *The Robert Lehman Collection*, 92–97, no. 12). Stylistically speaking, this miniature fits within the oeuvre of the Baudeloo Missal Master as discussed below, but it cannot be proven that it comes from any of the manuscripts mentioned by Blackburn from which an *Annunciation* is missing ("Messages in Miniature", 165 table 1).

following section of this article, we will see how the illuminator of Mech applied elements of this *Annunication* in scenes with a completely different subject.

## THE MASTER OF THE BAUDELOO MISSAL

Since the last three masses in Mech are not illustrated, I will now take a closer look at the style of the miniatures and the accompanying border illuminations, and subsequently consider the grotesque initials. Maria Kapp attributes the miniatures in Mech to Gerard Horenbout (the *Resurrection* and the *Anna Gravida*) and to one of the assistants in his workshop (Charles V and his entourage, Maximilian, the portraits of the popes and the *Annunciation*).[43] Kapp's dissertation dates from 1987, and she is the only person to date to have studied the entire Alamire corpus from an art historian's perspective. In 1999, Dagmar Thoss contributed an essay to the *Treasury of Petrus Alamire* catalogue in which she discussed a number of manuscripts and made a few new attributions. Among other things, Thoss discerned "a characteristic style related to the work of Horenbout (or the Master of James IV of Scotland)" and pronounced the *Annunciation* in Mech one of the examples of that style.[44] The "Master of James IV of Scotland" is an anonymous illuminator, but his oeuvre corresponds well to what is known about the life of Gerard Horenbout. For this reason, art history literature usually assumes that these illuminators are the same individual, although this identification cannot be proven.[45] Michaela Krieger, who devoted a monograph, published posthumously in 2012, to the manuscripts attributed to Gerard Horenbout and the Master of James IV of Scotland, came to the same conclusion. Krieger rejected the attribution of Mech to Horenbout and even believed (rightly, in my view) that the workshop responsible for the music manuscripts was only distantly connected to Horenbout's workshop.[46]

In the meantime, the "characteristic style" described by Thoss had been identified by others in manuscripts that did not belong to the

43 Kapp, "Musikalische Handschriften", 100–13.
44 Thoss, "Flemish Miniature Painting", 58–61.
45 The name used for the anonymous illuminator refers to a book of hours made for King James IV of Scotland (Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Cod. 1897). For a summary of the question, see Kren and McKendrick, *Illuminating the Renaissance*, 366–67, 427–28.
46 Krieger, *Gerard Horenbout*, 330 n. 270, 510 n. 393.

Alamire corpus.[47] Independently of each other, Gregory Clark and I added a few manuscripts to the oeuvre. Clark gave the illuminator the provisional name of "the Master of the Baudeloo Missal", after a missal completed in about 1500 for the abbot of the Cistercian abbey of Baudeloo.[48] He also attributed the Thurn and Taxis Hours to this master,[49] along with a limited number of miniatures and borders in the Da Costa Hours, for which Simon Bening was the main illuminator.[50] According to Clark, a few of the miniatures supplied by the Baudeloo Missal Master were retouched by Bening.[51] In *Re-Making the Margin*, I noted that this illuminator's style corresponds to a certain type of border illumination, and I listed the manuscripts and miniatures that I believed belonged to the oeuvre:[52] the *Assumption of Mary* in D-Ju 3, two miniatures in I-Rvat 160,[53] the Thurn and Taxis Hours, a Life of St. Colette intended for Margaret of Austria,[54] three single miniatures in the Fitzwilliam Museum collection in Cambridge,[55] and the Baudeloo Missal. I would like to re-examine the role of the Baudeloo Missal Master within the Alamire corpus in this article. I have since come to believe that the number of music manuscripts that can be ascribed to his workshop is even greater.[56] Although stylistic differences between the miniatures indicate that more than one hand was at work within the corpus, the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop nonetheless took the lead in the production of the Alamire choirbooks.[57]

Mech represents the highest level of work that the Baudeloo Missal Master could deliver. Most of the stylistic differences between the miniatures that seem to be visible on reproductions disappear when viewing the originals. For this reason, I am more inclined to attribute them to

47 Lieve De Kesel has also conducted research into this illuminator; see her dissertation at Ghent University in 2013, to be edited for future publication.
48 Ghent, Universiteitsbibliotheek, Ms. 74. Available online via https://lib.ugent.be/catalog/rug01:000783737.
49 Chantilly, Musée Condé, Ms. 86 [1178] (also mentioned by Clark, *Das Da Costa-Stundenbuch*).
50 Clark, *Das Da Costa-Stundenbuch*, 33–34.
51 Clark (*Das Da Costa-Stundenbuch*, 33) built on an observation by Thomas Kren, who had situated this illuminator in the school of the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500.
52 As-Vijvers, *Re-Making the Margin*, 524–25.
53 The miniatures in D-Ju 3 and I-Rvat 160 had previously been mentioned by Thoss, "Flemish Miniature Painting".
54 Arras, Bibliothèque municipale, Ms. 894 (0461) (previously mentioned by Thoss, "Flemish Miniature Painting").
55 Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, Marlay cuttings, Fl. 5a, 5b, and 5c; see Panayotova (ed.), *Colour*, 328 no. 98.
56 I have been able to study the originals of Mech and B-Br 15075; I had access to high-resolution images of the other manuscripts.
57 Besides the illuminator now known as the Baudeloo Missal Master, Thoss identified two other styles (in "Flemish Miniature Painting", 57–58), which she described respectively as a follower of Horenbout and related to Bening. In my view, both styles are to be situated within the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop.

the influence of different models (as discussed in the paragraphs above) than to contributions by different hands. The Baudeloo Missal Master often depicts his subject from a somewhat elevated perspective. His solid-looking figures stand out clearly against the light, bright colours of the background. Male figures have large heads with clear contours, powerful cheekbones, and pointed earlobes; female figures have somewhat oval faces and pointy chins. In both cases, the dark outline around the eyes and the dark dots for the pupils make the eyes protrude slightly. The faces are pale and extremely carefully modelled, but despite their attentive gazes, the figures remain inward-looking. The faces are surrounded by curly locks of hair that hang down in rows of adjacent strands. The hands are modelled in the same way as the faces, with contour lines around the figures, and they make gesturing movements. Clothing and other textiles hang in somewhat angular but effective folds, with golden hatching. Pale red, deep blue, a bright orange, and a green that verges on blue are used for the fabrics. The clothing is decorated with brocade patterns, whereas baldachins and canopies are usually adorned with embroidered letters or decorative edgings. Landscapes consist of greyish hills with a little green grass at the top; small, sparsely leaved trees grow on the hills. There are bluish hills on the horizon, where the silhouette of a city can be seen.

The border illuminations around the miniatures in Mech consist of the trompe l'oeil borders characteristic of this period, with flowers, birds, and insects set against a coloured background. Both "strewn-flower borders" (only containing flowers) and "flower-and-acanthus borders" (leafy branches combined with flowers) can be found.[58] In general, a particular style of miniature is combined with a given style of strewn border, and that is also the case here.[59] Only fol. 2$^{r}$ differs from the other borders in Mech (an observation I will return to later). Characteristic features of the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop are lively little birds with a rounded back and abdomen, often with their heads and wings raised; peacocks with bodies in the same basic rounded shape; butterflies, sometimes with narrow wings, whose pattern is added with a pen; snails with relatively small shells on their backs; pansies with

58 Discussion of the various types of *trompe l'oeil* borders in As-Vijvers, *Re-Making the Margin*, 17–19, 165-180.
59 As-Vijvers, *Re-Making the Margin*, 353–55.

an elongated lower petal; columbines whose petals overlap like scales (which may have been intended to represent double-flowered columbines[60]); and red carnations with clearly indicated white stamens and pistils (usually three pairs of short transverse lines, with two more lines arcing outwards like little fountains).[61] The borders are executed in the same "clean" style as the miniatures, as can be seen, for example, in the perfectly round strawberries and the regularly occurring text scrolls.[62]

If we consider the Alamire corpus in more or less chronological order,[63] we find that the Baudeloo Missal Master's style can be found even in several of the earliest manuscripts. This chronology also applies to the non-musical manuscripts produced by the Baudeloo Missal Master, starting with the Baudeloo Missal that is likely to have been produced in about 1500.[64] Besides being the book that gave the master his name, this is probably the illuminator's earliest extant manuscript. The missal was commissioned by Pieter van Heetvelde, the abbot of the Cistercian abbey of Baudeloo in Sinaai (near Sint-Niklaas), who died in 1504. He had himself painted in the manuscript several times (▶ Fig. II.7). Some of the figures seem somewhat doll-like, because the historiated initials in the missal are much smaller than the miniatures in the music manuscripts. Nevertheless, the facial types are very similar, and so are the motifs in the border decorations. The missal contains two pages where – instead of strewn borders – individual motifs without a coloured background have been painted onto the parchment, a variation on the marginal decoration that is also used in a few music manuscripts.[65]

▶ p. 171

Shortly after the Baudeloo Missal, the earliest known music manuscript to which the Baudeloo Missal Master contributed was produced. Choirbook B-Br 9126, copied by Alamire's predecessor "Scribe B", was produced between 1504 and 1505 for Philip the Fair and Joanna of Castile.[66] The recipients are depicted at the beginning of the manuscript

60 It seems likely from the description in Dodoens's herbal or *Cruijdeboeck* (1554) that the double-flowered columbine was already known in this period; see http://caliban.mpipz.mpg.de/dodoens_3/high/00203.html.
61 See specifically fols. 16$^{v}$, 34$^{v}$.
62 For example fol. 49$^{v}$.
63 For the Alamire corpus, my information is based mostly on Kellman (ed.), *The Treasury*, which sets out the arguments for dating each manuscript.
64 Ghent, Universiteitsbibliotheek, Ms. 74. See Derolez, *Medieval Manuscripts*, 48–49; Clark, *Das Da Costa-Stundenbuch*, 33–34; *Gent – Duizend jaar kunst en cultuur*, volume 2, 391–92 no. 633; Masai, "Un Missel Cistercien".
65 Ghent, Universiteitsbibliotheek, Ms. 74. 17$^{r}$, 23$^{8r}$. Compare D-Ju 4, GB-Lbl 8.G.vii, I-Rvat 36.
66 Hofmann, "Portraits as Leitmotif", 217–20; Krieger, *Gerard Horenbout*, 330 n. 270; Kellman, "Brussels, Bibliothèque royale de Belgique MS 9126".

(in two separate miniatures), facing an enthroned Virgin and Child (▶ Fig. II.8). The rest of the choirbook does not contain any painted decorations (only the early form of cadel initials; see below). The modelling of the figures is still close to that in the Baudeloo Missal and is softer than in later manuscripts. The facial expressions of the female figures in particular are typical of the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop, as can be seen in a comparison of the kneeling Joanna to the young Charles's three sisters in Mech's opening miniature (▶ Fig. I.1).

▶ p. 172
▶ p. 162

The Baudeloo Missal Master's contribution to B-Br 9126 is the first in a long series of works for the Burgundian-Habsburg court. For example, he painted the only miniature in a Life of St. Colette for Margaret of Austria, which has a colophon that includes the date 18 April 1510.[67] Margaret was particularly devoted to St. Colette and encouraged her worship.[68] The miniature depicts Colette kneeling before an altar, accompanied by St. Francis, the patron saint of the Franciscan order. The small trees around the two saints are a reference to a vision described in the Life of St. Colette. The composition of this miniature is based on a late fifteenth-century print from the convent of the Poor Clares in Ghent.[69] At the bottom is a scroll bearing Margaret's motto, "FORTUNE INFORTUNE FORT UNE".[70]

The three single miniatures in Cambridge, which derive from a lost book of hours, presumably date from the same time or a little later.[71] The miniatures represent the Flight into Egypt, the Lamentation of Christ, and the Mass of St. Gregory. In the *Flight into Egypt* (▶ Fig. II.9), the Baudeloo Missal Master combines an elevated viewpoint with a solid outcrop of rocks in the middle ground, with which he creates depth in the same way as in the miniatures of the Resurrection in Mech and D-Ju 4.[72] The vegetation on the rocks and the depiction of the landscape

▶ p. 174

67 Arras, Bibliothèque municipale, Ms. 894 (0461), fol. 2v; Thoss, "Flemish Miniature Painting", 61 Fig. 18.

68 Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 183–84. On Margaret of Austria as a patron, see, among others, Eichberger, "Erzherzogin Margarete von Österreich".

69 Debae, *La bibliothèque de Marguerite d'Autriche*, 472–73 no. 338. I do not know of any online image of the print, but a copy of it is included in a *Life of St. Colette* printed by Jan Van Den Kerchove in 1668–69; see http://balat.kikirpa.be/photo.php?path=M263392&objnr=52207&nr=15.

70 "Fate makes a woman very unfortunate" (the last two French words are incorrectly written as one in the miniature).

71 Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, Marlay cuttings, Fl. 5a, 5b and 5c. The *terminus post quem* is 1503, since there is a prayer with an indulgence by Pope Julius II (1503–13), written on Fl. 5c by the original scribe (Panayotova [ed.], *Colour*, 328 no. 98).

72 As well as the IDEM database, see Hofmann, "Portraits as Leitmotif", 221; Jas and Kellman, "Jena, Thüringer Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek MS 4", 92–93.

are typical. As in the Life of St. Colette in Arras and some illustrations in the Baudeloo Missal (e.g., fol. 268$^{v}$), we see somewhat stiffer folds in the clothing and a more angular line of the jaw. The strewn border of the *Flight into Egypt* contains characteristic motifs such as a round bird, double columbine, and a carnation whose stamens consist of two sets of three short parallel lines, with two pistils arcing outwards above them (▶ Fig. II.9, lower margin). ▶ p. 174

In several manuscripts produced in this period, we find somewhat softer modelling. An example of this is A-Wn 15495, copied by the Alamire workshop between 1508 and 1510 for Maximilian and Bianca Maria Sforza.[73] For the Nativity (▶ Fig. II.10), the Baudeloo Missal Master returned to a composition from the Baudeloo Missal (fol. 19$^{v}$), but the figures have a far more charming appearance. This suggests the influence of the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500,[74] who illuminated A-Wn 1783 in this period.[75] This master has already been mentioned above as one of the sources of inspiration for the *Anna Gravida* in Mech. The spatial structure in which Maximilian is depicted with his guardian angel (▶ Fig. II.11) is essentially the same as the one in which the Baudeloo Missal Master later placed the *Annunciation* in Mech.[76] Despite the softer style of A-Wn 15495, the eyes with a dark outline and the slightly foolish expressions of the figures in A-Wn 15495 are still typical of the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop. The Virgin of Mercy in D-Ju 12 (fol. 33$^{v}$; ▶ Fig. II.12) is painted in the same, softer style.[77] In particular, the kneeling Maximilian in A-Wn 15495 corresponds closely to D-Ju 12 (▶ compare Fig. II.12 and II.11). What is more, the small birds in the borders of both manuscripts are slightly more slender and more evenly coloured than usual.[78] ▶ p. 175 ▶ p. 175 ▶ p. 176 ▶ p. 176 & 175

According to Birgit Lodes, A-Wn 15495 was produced in response to the Treaty of Cambrai in 1508, with which Maximilian formed an alliance

73 Lodes, "Des Kaisers Alamire", 248; Hofmann, "Portraits as Leitmotif", 221; Jas, "Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS Mus. 15495".
74 For this illuminator, see Kren and McKendrick, *Illuminating the Renaissance*, 394, and Lieve De Kesel's dissertation (Ghent University, 2013).
75 Kellman, "Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Handschriftensammlung, MS 1783".
76 Note the entrance on the left, the kettle in a niche, the edge of the barrel vault above it, and the baldachin.
77 Kellman, "Jena, Thüringer Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek MS 12".
78 D-Ju 12 is usually dated to c. 1508–25, and within that period c. 1518–20 is considered the most probable. The stylistic correspondence to A-Wn 15495 suggests a somewhat earlier date. Given the extant borders on the facing page (fol. 18$^{r}$), the lost miniature in D-Ju 12 is likely to have been painted by the same illuminator. The third miniature in D-Ju 12 (fol. 50$^{v}$) belongs to the stylistic group of the Master of Charles V; this hand also painted the opening miniatures in B-Br 228 (fols. 1$^{v}$–2$^{r}$). The last miniature (fol. 111$^{v}$) is in a general Flemish style.

with his former archenemy, France. She deduced this from the inclusion of various recent compositions associated with the French court.[79] Might Maximilian have had a choirbook made for the French King, Louis XII, besides the one he had made for himself? Although no such manuscript has been preserved, four cuttings in the Louvre's collection would fit into this context. One of the miniatures shows Louis XII and the second depicts his wife Anne of Brittany, whom he married in 1499. Both are accompanied by their patron saint: St. Louis and St. Anne, who is depicted here as *Anna Selbdritt*. The other two miniatures contain the coats of arms of Brittany and of France combined with Brittany (with a crown set atop both).[80] Although the four miniatures have been glued onto paper, it is still possible to see that at least one of them has music on the back.[81] Up to now, these miniatures were considered to belong stylistically to the school of the Master of James IV of Scotland, but the lines are drier than usual for that illuminator.[82] The solid-looking figures and the facial features with the dark outline around the eyes of the kneeling royal couple are strongly reminiscent of the Baudeloo Missal Master's style. Moreover, various elements in the staging of the space around the two patrons (altar, altarpiece, choir screen, and prie-dieu) are derived from the Arras manuscript containing the Life of St. Colette.

The Baudeloo Missal Master also took charge of the portrait of the kneeling patron in the choirbook commissioned by Ulrich Pfintzing between 1512 and 1515 (possibly in about 1513) (A-Wn 15497; ▶ Fig. II.13).[83] Pfintzing is accompanied by his patron saint Ulrich, Bishop of Augsburg, who holds a gospel book since he is a bringer of the Word. The fish lying on the book is a reference to an event in his legend, where a piece of meat turned into a fish because it was Friday.[84] The miniature of the patron is found with the first complete mass in the manuscript (La Rue's *Missa Ista est speciosa*), but the accompanying miniature on the opposite side (doubtless a depiction of Mary) has been lost.[85] The opening minia-

▶ p. 177

79 Lodes, "Des Kaisers Alamire".
80 Paris, Musée du Louvre, Cabinet des dessins, Fonds des dessins et miniatures, RF 1699 (Anne), RF 1699 bis (Louis), RF 1699 ter (Britanny) and RF 1699 quater (France combined with Brittany). Kren, "Quatre miniatures découpées dans un manuscrit musical", 321–24, nos. 162–65. Images can be found at arts-graphiques.louvre.fr (search for "Horenbout").
81 RF 1699 ter. Kren, "Quatre miniatures découpées", 322.
82 Kren, "Quatre miniatures découpées dans un manuscrit musical", 323.
83 Jas and Kellman, "Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS Mus. 15497".
84 Kirschbaum and Braunfels, *Lexikon*, vol. 8, col. 507–10.
85 Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 165 table 1.

ture in A-Wn 15497, accompanying a Kyrie for Easter, has been preserved though, and shows the Resurrection; it is uncertain whether or not this was painted by the Baudeloo Missal Master.[86] In particular, the less structured golden hatchings on the folds of clothing and the Christ figure's vague expression suggest that it was painted by another hand. Since both the composition and border illumination do correspond to the Baudeloo Missal Master's usual work, there is no reason to seek this hand outside the workshop.

The large choirbooks Mech and D-Ju 4 were produced from 1515 onwards. Both contain portraits of Maximilian's grandchildren. D-Ju 4 was probably made for Maximilian, although it is uncertain whether he intended it for himself or as a gift. On fol. 16$^{r}$, Charles V is portrayed as the king of Spain, with his coat of arms below. The margin contains painted banners with the heraldic emblems of those regions that had passed into Charles's hands after the death of King Ferdinand II of Aragon. The representation of these territories on banners (rather than as coats of arms) probably refers to the coronation ceremony in March 1516, during which the displaying of banners played an essential role. On fol. 30$^{r}$, King Henry VIII of England is depicted with his consort Catherine of Aragon. The inclusion of these portraits can probably be explained by Maximilian's intentions in 1516 to adopt Henry as his son and possible successor, thus strengthening the bonds with England.[87]

What is remarkable, as Elizabeth Morrison has explained, is that the illuminations on the left- and right-hand pages in D-Ju 4 (with one exception) are the work of two different hands. The rectos were painted by an illuminator known as "the Master of the David Scenes in the Grimani Breviary" (or "the David Master" for short).[88] This may indicate a change to the intended purpose of D-Ju 4 during its production,[89] or it may be due to the fact that the Baudeloo Missal Master had another project to deal with in about 1516 (compare below). Only the opening of the first

86 Reproduced in Jas and Kellman, "Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Musiksammlung, MS Mus. 15497", 156.

87 My thanks to Honey Meconi for bringing this to my attention (e-mail, 14 August 2018). See also Meconi, "Power, Prestige, Polyphony", 182.

88 He is named after a series of scenes from the life of the Old Testament King David that he contributed to the Grimani Breviary; see Kren and McKendrick, *Illuminating the Renaissance*; Morrison, "Iconographic Originality"; As-Vijvers, *Re-Making the Margin*; König and Heyder, *Das Breviarium Grimani*, 233.

89 According to Morrison ("Music Meant to Impress", 173 n. 30) the recto sides were replaced during the production process, although the scribe remained the same.

mass in D-Ju 4 (La Rue's *Missa Ave sanctissima*) displays stylistic unity. The *Coronation of the Virgin* (fol. 8$^{v}$), the *Kneeling Maximilian with his Guardian Angel* and the coat of arms opposite (fol. 9$^{r}$), and all the border decorations are the work of the Baudeloo Missal Master (▶ Fig. II.15).[90] At the beginning of the second mass (La Rue's *Missa pascale*), the Baudeloo Missal Master painted the *Resurrection* discussed above and the two coats of arms beside the tenor and bassus parts below (fol. 15$^{v}$). The border illuminations – including the individual scatter motifs in the inner and lower margins – are the work of his workshop. However the right-hand page with the portrait of Charles (accompanied by Charlemagne) and the banners in the margin are by the David Master (fol. 16$^{r}$).

▶ p. 179

The iconography of the miniature that accompanies the third mass, La Rue's *Missa Conceptio tua*, takes the doctrine of the Immaculate Conception as its theme. Rather than using the *Anna Gravida* composition in Mech, the Baudeloo Missal Master opted for an allegorical scene in which Mary and the Christ-Child are standing next to the Tree of Life, and Eve is standing next to the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil, with Maximilian and Charles kneeling in the foreground (fol. 29$^{v}$).[91] The miniature of Nicholas IV at the bottom of this page is also by the Baudeloo Missal Master, who has placed the pope in the same landscape as the one in the *Resurrection* in D-Ju 4. However, the portrait of John Duns Scotus in the middle was done by the David Master, as were the portraits of King Henry VIII of England and his wife Catherine of Aragon, along with the coat of arms on the facing recto (fol. 30$^{r}$). There was not really any space left for the portraits of the other popes, but the David Master managed to fit them into the upper border. The accompanying texts were added directly to the parchment. Since the David Master's compositions do not display any influence from miniatures like the ones that had been painted in Mech at the beginning of the *Missa Conceptio tua*, he probably had not seen the latter and had only received instructions as to which scenes he was expected to paint.

This division of tasks was retained in the last illustrated mass (La Rue's *Missa de septem doloribus*). Here, the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop painted a miniature of the Seven Sorrows of Mary (see below)

90 Morrison had already noted the different hands in the miniatures, in "Music Meant to Impress".

91 For the interpretation of the scene see Smeyers, "De hostieboom"; Blackburn, "Messages in Miniature", 174–78; Morrison, "Music Meant to Impress", 174, 176.

and also provided the borders and the decorated initial with a typical little bird in it (fol. 42$^{v}$), while the David Master took on the three facing miniatures, showing Maximilian's grandchildren Ferdinand, Eleanor, Isabella, Mary, and Catherine, along with their patron saints (fol. 43$^{r}$).

In contrast to the Baudeloo Missal Master, the David Master was only incidentally involved in the illumination of music manuscripts. His contribution to D-Ju 4 possibly led to a new commission, since he also provided the opening miniatures to D-Ju 5, presumably some time later.[92] Just as in D-Ju 4, the opening mass was a *Missa Ave sanctissima*, illustrated with Our Lady in the Sun, crowned by angels, and with a kneeling patron (Frederick the Wise this time, accompanied by St. Catherine). When comparing both manuscripts, the stylistic differences between the two illuminators are clear. The David Master also painted the border illuminations in D-Ju 5. The refined, slightly curling petals are typical of his strewn-flower borders, as is the elegantly turning peacock.

At about the same time as the two large choirbooks Mech and D-Ju 4, the Baudeloo Missal Master was involved in the illumination of a book of hours. He was still working for Maximilian, who appointed the nobleman Franz von Thurn und Taxis (De la Tour et Tassis) as the general postmaster of the empire in 1516. A book of hours preserved in Chantilly contains two full-page miniatures at the beginning with the coats of arms of Thurn and Taxis and Maximilian himself (fol. 14$^{v}$–15$^{r}$; ▶ Fig. II.14), which means it was probably made to commemorate this appointment.[93] A comparison of Maximilian's coat of arms in the Thurn and Taxis book of hours (fol. 15$^{r}$) with the one in D-Ju 4 (fol. 9$^{r}$; ▶ Fig. II.15) makes it clear that both are to be attributed to the same illuminator, the Baudeloo Missal Master. The acanthus leaves in white with gold (with dark, V-shaped accents that evoke the effect of ermine) and the links in the collar of the Golden Fleece are painted in exactly the same way.[94] The coat of arms in the Thurn and Taxis manuscript on fol. 14$^{v}$ appears not to have been

▶ p. 178

▶ p. 179

92 Kellman, "Jena, Thüringer Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek MS 5"; made for Frederick the Wise and therefore to be dated to c. 1512–21.

93 Chantilly, Musée Condé, Ms. 86 (1178). With thanks to Gregory Clark for reproductions of this book of hours. Images can also be found at https://bvmm.irht.cnrs.fr/.

94 I do not share Clark's opinion (*Das Da Costa-Stundenbuch*, 33) that the two coats of arms (fols. 14$^{v}$–15$^{r}$) and the *Salvator Mundi* (fol. 15$^{v}$) are stylistically different from the other illuminations and only added to the book after 1516, while the book itself may date from around 1500–10.

painted by the same hand as the one in fol. 15$^{r}$, but it can presumably be attributed to a hand that occurs elsewhere in the Alamire corpus.[95]

Besides the coats of arms, the Baudeloo Missal Master also provided all the other full-page miniatures in the Thurn and Taxis Hours, including the borders around them.[96] He used the same composition for the *Annunciation* as in Mech, while the *Mass of St. Gregory* is a somewhat "zoomed out" version of one of the single miniatures in Cambridge.[97] The strewn-flower border around the Pentecost miniature contains the now familiar motifs (▶ Fig. II.16). The Baudeloo Missal Master also painted a fair number of border decorations around the incipits – the opening words of the texts – facing the miniatures.[98] However the majority of them were executed by a different illuminator whose style is related to that of the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500. This illuminator also painted the calendar scenes and most of the smaller miniatures for the Thurn and Taxis Hours. Some of the small miniatures accompanying the suffrages are stylistically reminiscent of the David Master's work.[99]

▶ p. 180

Where the decoration of an opening was done by two different illuminators, the difference in painting style is easy to see, not just in the flowers but particularly in the lively birds, which have more oval-shaped bodies than those of the Baudeloo Missal Master and whose abdomens are traced with a thin line of ink. The snails also have much larger shells, and the curve of their shells is unusually marked with blue lines (▶ Fig. II.16). This style of strewn border resembles the border on fol. 2$^{r}$ of Mech (the only page in that manuscript whose border illuminations could not be attributed to the Baudeloo Missal Master). Not only the birds and flowers are painted in a similar way, but even the snail shells are modelled with blue lines.[100] It thus seems probable that the decoration of fol. 50$^{r}$ of Mech (facing the miniature of the Annunciation), consisting of green branches garlanded with text scrolls, was executed by this illuminator as well. The Thurn and Taxis Hours contains a border with the same motifs, whose similarities are obvious (▶ Fig. II.17). In both manuscripts, the

▶ p. 180

▶ p. 181

95 E.g., in B-Br IV.922, fol. 13$^{r}$.
96 With the exception of the *Salvator Mundi* (fol. 15$^{v}$).
97 Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, Marlay cuttings, Fl. 5c; illustration in Morgan and Panayotova (eds.), *Illuminated Manuscripts in Cambridge*, 232 no. 242.
98 Baudeloo Missal Master: full-page miniatures with borders on four sides, with or without the facing recto: fols. 15$^{r}$, 19$^{v}$, 25$^{v}$, 42$^{v}$, 57$^{v}$, 58$^{r}$(?), 75$^{v}$–76$^{r}$, 87$^{v}$, 92$^{v}$–93$^{r}$, 97$^{v}$–98$^{r}$, 102$^{v}$–103$^{r}$, 107$^{v}$, 115$^{v}$–116$^{r}$, 121$^{v}$, 130$^{v}$–131$^{r}$, 151$^{v}$.
99 For a division of hands, see As-Vijvers, "The Grotesque Initials".
100 The same style can be found in D-Ju 9, fols. 1$^{v}$–2$^{r}$.

Baudeloo Missal Master was responsible for the facing verso, painting both the miniature and the adjacent border. The conclusion to be drawn from all of this is that the Baudeloo Missal Master worked with the same illuminator on both the Thurn and Taxis Hours and Mech.

The Baudeloo Missal Master was only partly involved in the illumination of another book of hours: the Da Costa Hours, also dating from c. 1515, was mainly illuminated by Simon Bening. The Baudeloo Missal Master painted the *Visitation*, the *Annunciation to the Shepherds*, and the *Circumcision*, including the historiated borders that surround them. The historiated borders around the *Flight into Egypt* and the *Coronation of the Virgin* also seem to be his work, but the scenes were finished, at least, by Bening.[101] The hand of the Baudeloo Missal Master cannot be discerned in the main body of the book; this manuscript was otherwise entirely designed by Bening's workshop. It is possible that this was the occasion when Simon Bening discovered the *Anna Gravida* composition available at the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop, since he used it in the Da Costa Hours (see above).

It is clear that although the Baudeloo Missal Master produced books of hours from time to time, he essentially specialised in the illumination of large-format choirbooks. In the period leading up to 1520 (probably 1515–16),[102] his hand can be found in I-Rvat 160, where he painted the miniatures accompanying the opening mass (the *Missa Virgo parens Christi*) with the Nativity and a kneeling Pope Leo X. The border style reveals that the Baudeloo Missal Master also painted the miniature for the second mass (*Missa Ave regina celorum*), but that miniature has been lost. There are another three pages with miniatures missing from this choirbook, but the decoration on the remaining rectos was executed by a different workshop, so this may also have been the case for the miniatures. I-Rvat 160 belonged to a three-volume set, which also included I-Rvat 34 and I-Rvat 36. However all the miniatures in those manuscripts have been lost, and the hand of the Baudeloo Missal Master cannot be identified in the remaining decoration.

It is clear from the above that the Baudeloo Missal Master regularly worked with the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500. This is

101 Kren, in Kren and McKendrick, *Illuminating the Renaissance*, 450–51 no. 140; Clark, *Das Da Costa-Stundenbuch*, 33–34.

102 Warmington, "Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Cappella Sistina 160".

again the case in D-Ju 3, made for Frederick the Wise in about 1518–20.[103] Likewise in this manuscript, the style of the borders changes along with the illuminators of the miniatures. The choirbook opens with Josquin's *Missa Faisant regretz*, indicated here with the name "Elizabeth", a reference to Elizabeth of Hungary, patron saint of Thuringia and whose name Frederick's mother shared. Consequently, the mass is illustrated with a *Visitation* (the meeting of Mary and Elizabeth, the mother of St. John the Baptist) by the Baudeloo Missal Master (▶ Fig. II.18). This scene does not occur elsewhere in the choirbooks, however there are close parallels in the Thurn and Taxis Hours (fol. 75$^{v}$) and Da Costa Hours (fol. 140$^{v}$). Although the decorated initials are kept relatively simple here, the verso is entirely surrounded by a strewn border in the style of the Baudeloo Missal Master. The name of the second mass is also a tribute to Frederick (*Missa Fridericus dux Saxsonie*) and is aptly decorated with his coat of arms, borne by angels and, owing to them, identifiable as the work of the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500 (fol. 15$^{v}$). This master also painted the third opening (Josquin's *Missa Ave maris stella*) with a scene of Mary enthroned in the company of music-making angels (fol. 29$^{v}$) and a kneeling Frederick accompanied by his guardian angel (fol. 30$^{r}$). Although the miniatures with kneeling patrons were the specific work of the Baudeloo Missal Master in most manuscripts, that is not the case here. However he did take on the fourth opening (Févin's *Missa Mente tota*), which is illustrated with the Assumption of the Virgin (fol. 43$^{v}$). Mary is being raised into heaven by angels who crown her on the way, as God the Father welcomes her with a gesture of blessing. Likewise, this is a composition that does not occur elsewhere in the choirbooks, but is encountered regularly in books of hours. A simplified form of this composition can be found in the earlier Baudeloo Missal (fol. 241$^{r}$).

▶ p. 182

A single miniature depicting Our Lady of the Seven Sorrows (▶ Fig. II.19) probably originates from the severely mutilated choirbook B-Br 6428.[104] The grieving Virgin is shown in the centre, surrounded by representations of the seven sorrows. A simpler version of this miniature can be found in D-Ju 4 (fol. 42$^{v}$), made in about 1516. This is not only the

▶ p. 183

103 Jas, "Jena, Thüringer Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek MS 3".

104 As argued in As-Vijvers, *Tuliba Collection*, 204–11 no. 19: Min. 6 (with illustrations). The Seven Sorrows miniature, which is held in a private collection currently kept at the Draiflessen Collection in Mettingen, belongs with La Rue's *Missa de doloribus beatae Mariae virginis* on fols. 43$^{r}$–61$^{r}$ of B-Br 6428 (available online at http://idemdatabase.org/).

period in which Margaret of Austria had the convent she had founded for the Annonciades in Bruges dedicated to the Seven Sorrows of Mary,[105] but also the time when the Baudeloo Missal Master contributed to Bening's Da Costa Hours (see above). The fluent succession of distinct scenes gives the miniature a narrative strength that suggests a familiarity with Simon Bening's work. The putti in the upper part of the miniature of the Seven Sorrows are comparable to those surrounding the enthroned Madonna in B-Br 9126. Although a date not too distant to that of D-Ju 4 would suggest itself from an art history perspective, musicological arguments and the development of the script used at the Alamire workshop mean that B-Br 6428 is currently dated to c. 1520–35.[106] The most likely date then seems to be somewhere near the earlier limit of this period.

It is not entirely clear how long the Baudeloo Missal Master remained active. The opening miniatures in B-Br 15075 cannot have been painted very long before the marriage of the people portrayed (King John III of Portugal and Charles V's sister Catherine of Austria) in 1524.[107] These miniatures are reminiscent of the style of the Baudeloo Missal Master, but their mannerism is not a feature of the master's own illuminations (fol. 2$^{r}$). Perhaps the difference in style has to do with the gap of several years that had passed, but it cannot be demonstrated that the master painted them, and the border decorations also differ from those in the preceding manuscripts on several points. In later manuscripts in the Alamire corpus, the Baudeloo Missal Master can no longer be traced.

## GROTESQUE INITIALS

In most choirbooks, only the first three or four masses have painted illustrations and borders. The same applies to Mech. After the four masses with miniatures, we find Pierre de la Rue's *Missa de sancta cruce*, *Missa de feria*, and *Missa Alleluya*, all three of which begin with grotesque initials. As explained by Thoss, grotesque initials belong to the tradition of cadel initials: the body of the letter consists of a woven fabric of lines with graceful decorative extensions to the ascenders or descenders, usu-

105 Eichberger, "The Seven Sorrows of the Virgin", 491–93.

106 With thanks to Honey Meconi for her explanation of the dating. See Meconi, "Pierre de la Rue", 106, and also Kellman, "Brussels, Bibliothèque royale de Belgique MS 6428"; Debae, *La bibliothèque de Marguerite d'Autriche*, 61–62 no. 39.

107 Gschwend, "Die vergessene Infantin", 54–55; Kellman, "Brussels, Bibliothèque royale de Belgique MS 15075"; illustration at http://idemdatabase.org/.

ally rendered with thick, typically black pen strokes.[108] In the choirbooks, these cadel initials are used to indicate the beginning of the different voice-parts on the pages that do not have any painted decorations. Some of the grotesque initials are essentially cadel initials with several lines replaced by coloured, three-dimensional elements. The body of the letter consists of artfully twisted branches and garlands, and Italian Renaissance motifs. Many letters are partly composed of human figures, among which the frequently occurring heads of grinning men are the most striking. The grotesque initials are typical of the Alamire corpus, although parallels for their different components can be found in the decorated initials and trompe l'oeil border illuminations in books of hours.[109]

The grotesque initials in Mech are of exceptionally high quality. There is a lightness to their execution that is not equalled in any other manuscript. On fol. 63$^{v}$, the *Missa de sancta cruce* opens with a large initial "K" for "Kyrie" in light hues (▶ Fig. II.20). The heads that are characteristic of grotesque initials have ruddy facial features with grey shadows here, and they are finished with lines of ink in particularly fine execution. In the middle of the initial, the guide letter "k", added by the scribe, is still visible. The lower initial on this page has been kept in grisaille (shades of grey), with clear shadows in the three-dimensional parts. The cadel lines are extended in such a way that the guide letter "t" is transformed into an inconspicuous little flourish. The cadels are extended with leaves in red ink that resemble penwork (fine linear embellishment of an initial, produced with a thin pen in red or blue ink). The facing recto only features cadel initials, where – as was customary – the colours of the initials are alternated and the red and blue letters have contrasting pen-flourishing in black or red respectively.

▶ p. 184

The last two masses in Mech are decorated in a similar way. What is remarkable here is that the maker of these initials has signed his work at the end: the middle initial on fol. 96$^{r}$ has a text scroll bearing the name "IACQUES SCOON" (▶ Fig. II.21). This illuminator is not known from other sources.[110]

▶ p. 185

A development can be noted within the Alamire corpus from relatively simple cadel initials to grotesque initials in grisaille and on to

108 Thoss, "Initialen und Bordüren".
109 Compare, for example, the Thurn and Taxis Hours (Chantilly, Musée Condé, Ms. 86), fols. 45$^{r}$, 131$^{r}$, 201$^{r}$.
110 See As-Vijvers, "The Grotesque Initials".

painted grotesque initials. The earliest choirbooks do not contain any grotesque initials. Here the initials mainly consist of cadel lines, partly filled in with simple branches and leaves and coloured with very soft hues of blue, pinkish red, green, and yellow.[111] These cadel initials develop into the grotesque initials rendered in grisaille such as those that can be found in Mech. These grotesque initials occur in many choirbooks, even in manuscripts that do not contain any miniatures. The grotesque initial at the beginning of the superius (the "K" for "Kyrie") is larger than the others. To emphasise the difference in hierarchy, the superius initial was usually set against a coloured background, leading to hybrid forms between the common type of decorated initials and grotesque initials. This development was already underway in the period when Mech was made. Letter shapes that have been kept in grisaille in Mech appear in full colour in A-Wn 15497 and D-Ju 4. In the long term, the use of grisaille for grotesque initials would disappear, and they would be painted increasingly with opaque paint. Nonetheless, the original designs are still readily identifiable even in the painted grotesque initials.[112]

This development raises the question as to whether the grotesque initials and their painted variants were executed by the same illuminators as the miniatures. The grotesque faces do not make for an easy stylistic comparison with the human faces in the miniatures. However, some of the birds and snails offer clues. Both A-Wn 15497 and D-Ju 4 contain a type of bird standing tall and a snail with a brown shell that has a wide "rim".[113] These motifs occur in both the grotesque initials that are rendered in grisaille and those that are placed on a coloured background. This makes it likely that both were executed by the same workshop. On the basis of the "normal" human faces occurring here and there in the initials,[114] it can then be confirmed that this decoration is not to be ascribed to either the Baudeloo Missal Master or the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500. The grotesque initials in D-Ju 4 and A-Wn 15497 were therefore painted by a different illuminator, whose presence can also be demonstrated elsewhere in the Alamire corpus. The scope of this article does not allow further untangling of the various hands in the gro-

111 B-Br 9162; A-Wn 15495.
112 Compare, for example, the man's head on the lower right in the Kyrie initials in B-Br 15075, fol. 22$^{v}$ and Mech, fol. 95$^{v}$.
113 For example A-Wn 15497, fols. 41$^{v}$, 83$^{v}$; D-Ju 4, fols. 77$^{v}$–78$^{r}$.
114 For example D-Ju 4, fol. 54$^{v}$.

tesque initials. Besides looking at the grisaille and painted grotesque initials, this would involve considering the border illuminations, the way the coats of arms (specifically the crest of the helmet) are painted, and the miniatures that are not the work of the Baudeloo Missal Master.[115]

## CONCLUSION

The choirbooks illuminated by the Baudeloo Missal Master are among the most luxurious codices in the Alamire corpus. The Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop was involved in some of the earliest manuscripts and remained active for two decades, between c. 1500 and c. 1520. Throughout that period, the Baudeloo Missal Master worked regularly with an illuminator from the circle of the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500. The Baudeloo Missal Master specialised in the illumination of music manuscripts and received his commissions mainly from the Burgundian-Habsburg court. Even the only complete book of hours that is known to have been painted by him, the Thurn and Taxis Hours, was a commission from Maximilian and a joint project that he worked on with the Master of the Prayer Books of around 1500. Incidentally, that does not necessarily mean that the Baudeloo Missal Master's workshop was based at the court of Margaret of Austria. The relationship between the Baudeloo Missal Master and the other illuminators within the Alamire corpus, particularly those responsible for the secondary decorations, demands further research. What is clear is that for prestigious assignments such as Mech, where miniatures dominated the illuminations, the Baudeloo Missal Master was the illuminator of choice.



115 An article on the subject (As-Vijvers, "The Grotesque Initials") is in press.